

DRAFT

Minutes of the Mayfield Village Civil Service Commission

March 10, 2014

Page 2

Police Department Update

- Police Officer Entrance Exam

Chief Edelman reported, we have a full-time officer retiring on June 13th. We are going to need a Civil Service test for entry level. Mary Beth has all of the information for testing. In the past, we have used I/O Solutions for our test. It worked out very well. They charge \$25.00 per test that they give out. We only pay for what we use. If we advertise for the first 50 applicants, we will order 50 tests. If only 30 of them show up the day of the test, we pay for 30 tests. We charge it back to the applicant anyway. They pay \$25.00 at the time of submitting the application.

Mr. Matty stated, the preliminary question is this. Normally, Mary Beth, correct me if I am misstating, what would happen is you would do a notice for a test and that notice would be posted and would go out via a newspaper of general circulation. The preliminary question that needs to be answered by the Commission is, and Chief Carcioppolo, I don't know if you are going to be requesting a test also, I have been requested by the Administration to review the current Civil Service Rules which are old and outdated at least as far as not having an update in how long, Diane?

Ms. Wolgamuth replied, I do not even know how old they are. They are undated. It's very hard to tell.

Mrs. Betsa added, there was a very minor revision made in 2012, but that is it.

Mr. Matty continued, okay, so the preliminary question for the Commission is, if you are going to be hearing a request for tests, do you want to test before the rules are updated or do you want to update the rules before you test? My educated guess is that it will take my office anywhere from 60-90 days to come back with a draft of updated Rules for you to review and hopefully implement or revise. I don't know the urgency, Chief Edelman, of the department. I don't know Chief Carcioppolo's urgency if he has one for testing, but if we begin a testing process, an example, the Chief has raised a minor issue to me before this meeting that would need to be addressed so that we know what pool of applicants age-wise would be appropriate for a Fire Department test. Do we go under our current Rules and get these two tests done and then update the Rules, or do we update the Rules first and then do the testing? We don't want to hurry through the Rules because of the number of changes in the Revised Code and because the Commission is going to learn, our Charter has quite a few provisions that other Charters don't when it comes to Civil Service testing and classified service in this community. We will be comparing Charter and State law with what we have and we will be searching other jurisdictions which Mary Beth has already provided us some that have updated their Civil Service Rules and try to put all of that together into a new proposal for you. I guess it's really your call to tell us which way you want to go.

Mr. DeBaggis asked, what would you suggest? Would it make more sense to have the Rules updated first?

Mr. Matty asked Chief Edelman, when is the retirement?

DRAFT

Minutes of the Mayfield Village Civil Service Commission

March 10, 2014

Page 3

Chief Edelman replied, June 13th.

Mr. Matty asked Chief Carcioppolo, do you have an urgent need?

Chief Carcioppolo replied, my preference would be that the Rules are updated because in reviewing what happened in the past, I think there's a need for that prior to giving a test that has a two-year eligibility list. I would say that getting those done and trying to coordinate once that's done and you guys meet and approve your Rules, at that meeting we can discuss the test.

Mr. DeBaggis asked, the two-year eligibility list, can you tell me what that is?

Chief Carcioppolo replied, once this test is validated and approved by the Civil Service Commission, it's a valid eligibility list for one year. You can extend it for one year by State law. That would be our hiring list for effectively two years. At that point in time, we would have to give another test to maintain an eligibility list. Right now at this time, we do not have one, because it expired last year.

Mr. Matty asked, Mary Beth, what's the timeframe from when you give a police test to when you get the results?

Mrs. Betsa replied, we have to have it in the newspaper for a couple of weeks. The applications will come in until the established deadline.

Mr. Matty asked, how long does it take the company to get you back the results of the test?

Mrs. Betsa replied, I/O Solutions is automatic. They are excellent. A quick turnaround.

Chief Edelman replied, two days.

Mrs. Bodnar stated, we have a very small police force as I understand it, so what would be the urgency of replacing an officer?

Chief Edelman replied, thank you. There is a sense of urgency because we typically have three or four cars on the road at a time. Missing a full-time officer creates a huge gap in our schedule.

Mrs. Bodnar asked, what were the problems with the old Rules?

Chief Carcioppolo replied, there were some issues which arose during the last entrance examination testing process. There was an issue with the age, the scoring and the extra credit.

Mr. Matty stated, if that is the case, my suggestion might be that if we have sufficient information for the Police Department to go forward with the test, we could do the Police Department's test under the current Rules. Mary Beth, we are going to have to review a draft of a Notice. Some of these credits in the past have not been consistent with the application of credits. I want to make sure what credits we are dealing with on an entrance level and perhaps

DRAFT

Minutes of the Mayfield Village Civil Service Commission

March 10, 2014

Page 4

what we could do is the Commission could authorize its Secretary to begin the preparation of a Notice with another meeting to be set to then go forward with the Notice and the testing company and/or procedure to be used for the Police Department. Since the Fire Department has just hired three new full-time firefighters, Fire Chief Carcioppolo shouldn't have an immediate need for a firefighter.

Chief Carcioppolo stated, although my spot on shift is running down, it's more important to get the Rules established.

Mr. Matty stated, if we hold on both tests, I am afraid we will never meet the Chief's objective of June 13th. If we wait for the revisions to the Rules, the procedures then would commence, sufficient notice would have to be given, the test would need to be administered and then we would have to wait for the results to come back.

Mrs. Betsa added, and the challenge period.

Mr. Matty agreed, and the protest period that exists for that. If that's a viable solution, we could actually split, since one is in need and the other really isn't. How outdated are the Rules? We can't tell you until we get into each Rule, but some of them are ancient. It's not that they are only ancient, but the Commission in the past has done things differently for the same situation. This is a Commission that has to come to some uniform approach to things going forward so everybody knows when they are going to come in for a test what is required, what credits are going to be given, etc. Chief, I don't know if that would work for you. You would be going under the old Rules. As long as you have the testing organization that you have confidence in, that will allow this Commission to give to the Mayor a list of 10 that they need to get to the Mayor because on an entrance position, you give the Mayor 10 of the best and he selects from the 10. This is not a promotion where you give him 3 and he gets to select from 3. If there are 10 names given to the Mayor, there are some interviews done and the Mayor will select from that list, correct Chief? And you are probably part of those interviews too?

Chief Edelman replied, yes. And just to clarify, it's not just the written test we are talking about. In addition to that, there's a physical agility test, there's the background investigation which consists of a polygraph, fingerprinting, and the detectives will do a work-up on all of the applicants. It's an involved process. It's not just a written test. We will get that raw score back very quickly but then we also have to factor in the extra points that we offer up for various accreditations they have and the physical agility test also.

Mr. Matty asked, Chief, does all that information then come back to the Commission for their determination of the top 10?

Chief Edelman replied, it does. What I have done in the past with the old Commission is I have ranked all of the applicants based on raw score. I have charted what extra credit is to be given and whether or not they have passed the agility test. Then I have met with the Commission to tally the total scores for each applicant.

DRAFT

Minutes of the Mayfield Village Civil Service Commission

March 10, 2014

Page 5

Mrs. Bodnar stated, I think the split sounds great to me. As long as it is acceptable to both of our Chiefs it seems like the best alternative.

Mr. DeBaggis agreed.

Mrs. Betsa will send the previous documentation to Chief Edelman with a copy to Mr. Matty and Ms. Garrett.

Mr. Matty stated, what we would need is a motion directing Mary Beth to begin the drafting of a Notice for a police patrolman's entrance examination.

. **Motion to authorize Mary Beth Betsa to begin drafting the Notice for a police patrolman's entrance examination.**

Mrs. Bodnar, seconded by Mr. DeBaggis, made a motion to authorize Mary Beth Betsa to begin drafting a Notice for a police patrolman's entrance examination.

Mr. DeBaggis asked, any discussion? There was none.

ROLL CALL:	Ayes: All	Motion Carried
	Nays: None	Drafting of Notice Approved

With regard to the testing agency, Mr. Matty asked for the recommendation by the Police Chief.

Chief Edelman stated, I/O Solutions did a wonderful job for us last time.

. **Motion to approve I/O Solutions as the testing agency for the police patrolman's entrance examination.**

Mr. DeBaggis, seconded by Mrs. Bodnar, made a motion to approve I/O Solutions as the testing agency for the police patrolman's entrance examination.

Mr. DeBaggis asked, any discussion?

Mr. Matty stated, I/O Solutions can be contacted so that they are ready to go.

ROLL CALL:	Ayes: All	Motion Carried
	Nays: None	I/O Solutions Approved as Testing Agency

Chief Edelman asked about whether or not there is a need for a motion on the format of the agility test. We use the standardized test that Tri-C uses. I don't know if we need to have this officially approved.

Mr. Matty replied, at the time they approve the Notice, we should have approval of that. We should have approval of all that we are going to do. We need the company to know tonight so

DRAFT

Minutes of the Mayfield Village Civil Service Commission

March 10, 2014

Page 6

that they know it is coming, but as far as the particulars, Mary Beth, have you done that with the initial notice or have you done that at the time that the Notice is actually approved by the Commission?

Mrs. Betsa replied, we retained the company and approved the physical agility format before the Notice is issued.

Chief Edelman stated, at the time the Notice goes out would be appropriate.

Mr. Matty stated, so we may have one more meeting of the Commission when we have our ducks in order as to what is going to go out to public members for the notice of the test.

Mrs. Betsa could not recall if the notice provided a date for the physical agility testing.

Chief Edelman stated, it doesn't. It didn't in the past because we did not know the date. We used I/O Solutions once before and we did not know how quickly they would have the results back to us. We could schedule both at the same time.

Mr. DeBaggis asked, does one come before the other?

Chief Edelman replied, the written test comes first. If someone does not pass the written test, they would not move forward to the next step.

Mr. Matty stated, the Notice of Examination that is going to go out has to contain information relating to the score and character of the examination and to the qualifications of applicants as the Commission may deem proper. Those kind of issues in the Notice will be what we are giving credits for, what the qualifications are, which would include age, and then if we get into the agility and other items like that, how have you indicated that in the past? The initial notice or after the testing?

Mrs. Betsa replied, in the past, Chief Dearden received the approval from the Commission of the \$25.00 application fee and then he passed around a draft of the paperwork associated with the testing. The Commission reviewed it and discussed any questions they had.

Mr. Matty asked, was that at the time of the approval of the Notice by the Commission?

Mrs. Betsa replied, the Commission was also provided the Notice with the paperwork.

Mrs. Bodnar asked, will you e-mail us all this information ahead of time?

Mrs. Betsa replied, yes.

Mr. Matty stated, Mary Beth will get you that in advance of the next meeting so that we would see what the draft Notice for the police test will be and at that meeting you may amend it or add to it so that when she leaves the meeting, she has a final that she is working with.

DRAFT

Minutes of the Mayfield Village Civil Service Commission

March 10, 2014

Page 7

Chief Carcioppolo asked, did you say you wanted all of the extra credit points to be the same for Police, Fire and Service?

Mr. Matty stated, we would need to take a look at extra credit points. Not only the Rules, but current State law and the Charter to determine a uniform approach as we go so that they are the same.

Chief Edelman asked, is that appropriate to do for all three departments?

Mr. Matty stated, yes because they are all entrance positions.

Chief Edelman stated, but the qualifications for police officer are not the same as that of a service department employee.

Mr. Matty stated, that will be different Chief, but the actual credits may be the same under either our Charter or our State law, not dependent upon department.

Chief Carcioppolo asked, you are talking about military points?

Mr. Matty replied, yes, military credit, or I can't remember if there was a residency credit.

Chief Edelman replied, we didn't do residency credit, we did military, peace officer training –

Mr. Matty added, and seniority, if you have a part-timer.

Chief Edelman continued, Mayfield Village experience. I think those were the only three.

Mrs. Betsa confirmed. The requirements were Peace Officer Training Academy Certificate, Honorable Discharge – Military and Part-time Police service credit. 2 points were given for Peace Officer's Training, 2 points for Honorable Discharge and 4 points for part-time police service.

Mr. DeBaggis asked, are the applicants able to challenge their ranking or scoring?

Mr. Matty replied, yes.

Mr. DeBaggis asked, how do they do that?

Mr. Matty replied, they do it in the form of a protest. If they don't think they have been properly tested, there's a protest procedure that allows that.

Mr. DeBaggis asked, and they come before this Commission?

Mr. Matty replied, they come before this Commission. The problem they have in doing that is this is not a mandatory take the first person. There's a discretion here in the top 10. So depending upon the type of protest, usually the protest that you may see is somebody that thinks they should

DRAFT

Minutes of the Mayfield Village Civil Service Commission

March 10, 2014

Page 8

be in the top 10 but is not. It's very difficult for somebody in the top 10 to say just because they are number 1 they should be chosen when our Charter has a provision that says, the Mayor has the discretion of 1-10.

Mrs. Bodnar asked, are the challenges based solely on how each individual scored or can you challenge the scoring system in relation to how other people have been scored?

Mr. Matty replied, both.

Chief Edelman replied, and the company as well has challenge protocols.

Mr. Matty stated, when you have one position and 150 applicants, sometimes it does create a situation where they are testing here and elsewhere.

Mrs. Bodnar asked, is that what we are typically looking at?

Mr. Matty stated, I don't have any idea of the numbers.

Chief Edelman stated, we have limited it to 50 applicants.

Mr. Matty asked, do you usually hit that?

Chief Edelman replied, we were close last time. I think we had 47.

Mrs. Bodnar asked, for one job?

Chief Edelman replied, for one job. That's just because we are a small department, but when you see cities like Cleveland or Cleveland Heights, they will have 300-400 applicants.

Mrs. Bodnar asked, there's no residency requirement here is there?

Chief Edelman replied, there's not.

Mr. Matty added, there can't be under the law, Brenda. Here's an example for a promotional exam. You have a seniority credit situation which says each full year of the first four years of service they get 1 percentage point. Each full year of the next 10 years they get a percentage and then there's a multiplication factor in here. If there's an applicant in the armed services, they get an additional credit of 20% of their total grade. So, there's some credits which go in here for both promotion and I would have to see what they are for entrance and what the State law says is credit and what our Charter says is credit. Those are the documents we review when we review a notice to make sure that you are going forward with at least the current Charter and current State law. Whether or not we have a rule that conforms to that, we may or we may not. It depends on the particular issue. That all has to be set up front in the notice so that everyone knows up front how it is going to be tested. Another thing that I have found to be very helpful was setting forth a range that this position would pay so that we don't have people testing thinking they are going to make \$80,000 and the position is going to pay \$50,000. When they see the Notice, they will

DRAFT

Minutes of the Mayfield Village Civil Service Commission

March 10, 2014

Page 9

know the range that may be paid for the position and whether or not they want to test based on that so we don't waste their time and we don't waste your time.

Chief Carcioppolo asked, would you just put the starting salary in?

Mr. Matty replied, it depends. Chief, do you have ranges? If the Chief just has a start, a probationary figure, that is what we would put in.

Chief Edelman replied, we do. That's in the wage ordinance. We have never used that in our Notice before.

Mr. Matty stated, we have never used it until we just did a testing last year. We probably should start doing it. As long as you are comfortable with it.

Chief Edelman stated, there's a set rate for probationary officers. So I would use that.

Mr. DeBaggis asked, any other discussion on this item? There was none.

Fire Department Update

- **Entrance Examination for Firefighter**

Chief Carcioppolo requested that this item be held until the Rules of the Civil Service Commission were updated.

. **Motion to hold the agenda item relating to entrance examination for Firefighter until completion of updates to the Civil Service Commission Rules.**

Mrs. Bodnar, seconded by Mr. DeBaggis, made a motion to hold the agenda item relating to entrance examination for Firefighter until completion of updates the Civil Service Commission Rules.

Mr. Matty asked Chief Carcioppolo, and you will participate in that update?

Chief Carcioppolo replied, if they would like me to. Absolutely.

ROLL CALL:	Ayes: All	Motion Carried
	Nays: None	Agenda Item Held

Revisions to the Civil Service Commission Rules

Mr. Matty asked for a motion authorizing our office to prepare a draft of the revised rules and report back to you in 90 days. That would be enough for today's meeting.

DRAFT

Minutes of the Mayfield Village Civil Service Commission

March 10, 2014

Page 10

Motion to authorize the law firm of Matty, Henrikson & Greve to review and prepare a draft of the revised Rules of the Civil Service Commission.

Mr. DeBaggis, seconded by Mrs. Bodnar, made a motion to authorize the law firm of Matty, Henrikson & Greve to prepare a draft of the revised Rules of the Civil Service Commission.

ROLL CALL:	Ayes: All	Motion Carried
	Nays: None	Rules to be revised by Matty., Henrikson & Greve

Chief Carcioppolo asked, have the rules been revised to state that you have to live within a contiguous County?

Mr. Matty replied, there is a law that we will check that says something to that effect. It's not in the actual community itself, but because we are dealing with safety forces and the emergency nature needed sometimes for a response, there is a provision like that. We will have to take a look at that. For example, for the police, we will need that notice to conform to that so that people know that if they are in Franklin County, it's not going to be appropriate to be selected from. We will make a note on that and will review that when we review the notice. The Commission wants the notice to be not only proper as to who takes it but how it is graded, what the position pays and what our procedure is going to be going forward with the testing company. Chief, you will have a part in that. You have done this before. You have to understand that some of what was done before was done without an analysis of some of this. We are going to try to do this one as we start with the new Commission by the Rules.

Mr. DeBaggis asked, how soon is someone on the job after the entire testing process?

Chief Edelman replied, it depends on the workload of the Detective Bureau in doing the background testing. The actual scoring does not take a long time but when they have to do background work on every applicant, now they can certify 10 applicants, it takes a long time to do that. It could be 6 months to a year. We don't want to wait that long obviously.

Mr. DeBaggis asked, but the officer is retiring when?

Chief Edelman replied, June 13th is his last day.

Next Meeting

Mr. Matty asked, what date would the Commission like to get back together? Do you want to set a date for the next meeting or do you want Mary Beth to send out requests for when you are available for the next meeting?

Mrs. Bodnar suggested that Mary Beth send a couple of dates by e-mail and coordinate schedules.

Mr. Matty asked, is there a time during the day that is better for the Commission to meet?

DRAFT

Minutes of the Mayfield Village Civil Service Commission

March 10, 2014

Page 11

Mr. DeBaggis replied, 5:30 is probably the earliest.

Mrs. Bodnar replied, that's fine with me too.

Mr. Matty asked, what about the morning?

Mrs. Bodnar replied, earliest before I go to the office.

Mr. DeBaggis replied, I am usually at my office by 7:30.

Mr. Matty suggested Mary Beth circulate an e-mail and coordinate schedules.

Adjournment

There being no further matters, Mr. DeBaggis, seconded by Mrs. Bodnar, made a motion to adjourn the meeting. The meeting was adjourned at 6:00 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Mary E. Betsa, Secretary
Civil Service Commission