

**ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD
MEETING MINUTES
Mayfield Village
Sept 13, 2012**

The Architectural Review Board met in regular session on Thurs, Sept 13, 2012 at 7:30 p.m. at the Mayfield Village Civic Center, Main Conf Room. Chairman Dinardo presided.

ROLL CALL

Present: Mr. Ron Dinardo Chairman
Mr. Joshua Klein Chairman Pro-Tem
Mrs. Mary Ann Wervey
Mr. Carmen Miozzi

Absent: Mr. Ivo Tombazzi
Mr. John Marrelli Building Commissioner

Also Present: Ms. Deborah Garbo Secretary

CONSIDERATION OF MEETING MINUTES: **Aug 23, 2012**

Mr. Miozzi, seconded by Mr. Klein made a motion to approve the minutes of Aug 23, 2012.

ROLL CALL

Ayes: All **Motion Carried.**
Nays: None **Minutes Approved As Written.**

PROPOSALS

1. Renovation (Revisions from ARB 8/9) Charter One Bank
789 SOM Ctr Rd.
Robert V. Buonaspina Architects
2. Porch Enclosure Patrick Lamb
6758 Bramblewood Ln.
Kenneth H. Martin, Architect
3. Addition Chris Kolp
984 Woodlane Dr.
Jack Wyban Design/Build Co., Inc
4. NEW Single Family Home David Soriano
6786 Bonnieview Rd.
Joseph L. Myers, Architect, Inc
5. Addition Lucy Hu
6933 Ravine Dr.
Any Season Construction

OPEN PORTION

**Patrick Lamb
6758 Bramblewood Ln.
Porch Enclosure**

Chairman Dinardo called the meeting to order, moving Charter One to the end while waiting for Joe Prcela to arrive. Joe's been instrumental in getting monies approved for revisions. We'll begin with Bramblewood's porch enclosure.

Bob Mizisin, Commons Builders introduced himself, will represent homeowner. He has an existing wood deck 14 x 20. They're interested in doing a screened enclosure for protection sitting on deck. They have a roll out protection that's starting to wear and looking for a more permanent structure to enjoy the summers. Siding & architectural grade black shingle will match. The existing house roof is close to 20 yrs old. The roof will blend into a new addition that was put on 10 yrs ago. Part of the addition's going to flex the 2nd floor of the house back wall and the east side of roof line will blend into an addition put on about 10 yrs ago. The new portion that's going on is about a 3 1/2 to 4 pitch. The saddle will be close to 2, depending how high I take it up. It'll be total ice guard with shingles on the existing. The saddled area will be a rolled sealed type. I'm trying to get away from water problems they have in the front of the house with the flat roof area. They're constantly getting ceiling leaks. With the saddled area in the back, if I take it up higher on the roof, I can get close to 4 1/2. We originally designed a flat roof, off the bat they said no. The pitch is determined by the 2nd floor bedroom window.

Chairman Dinardo asked what's being done underneath to protect from animals.

Bob Mizisin replied lattice. Right now it's really low, you can hardly squeeze under it. Bushes around the one side pretty much cover it up. Across the front, once the new set of steps is put on the deck landing, that's going to take care of some of it, but there's still going to be about 6' on both sides that's going to have to be covered up once the bushes are gone.

Chairman states this looks straight forward, tying into existing house with similar material.

Bob Mizisin said white trim, decking material light gray to match. You come off the existing porch, down the steps onto another landing which is gray, then down more steps into the backyard. We'll take that set of steps off, add decking to that and we use what's there.

DECISION

Mrs. Wervey, seconded by Mr. Miozzi made a motion to approve porch enclosure for Patrick Lamb at 6758 Bramblewood Ln as presented.

ROLL CALL

Ayes: Mr. Dinardo, Mr. Klein, Mrs. Wervey, Mr. Miozzi

Nays: None

Motion Carried.

Drawings Approved & Signed.

**Chris Kolp
984 Woodlane Dr.
Addition**

Chairman Dinardo asked the Kolp's to explain proposal.

Chris & Elaine Kolp introduced themselves. We've got this little closet size bathroom on the side of our house that desperately needs to be redone. We imagined a larger bathroom and brought the laundry room upstairs, then secondary a mud room.

Jack Wyban Design Build Company said we'll be matching everything; siding, brownish roof, white trim and brick foundation.

Chris Kolp said we're building a basement, add another sump pump and tie into existing tile.

Jack Wyban said we'll follow the same pitch. The rear roof will be a little shallower in order to make it blend. That section will be completely ice guarded with shingle over, about a 3, 3 1/4 / 12 pitch. Shutters will match.

Mr. Miozzi asked about window egress in basement.

Jack Wyban replied there will be an egress window.

Chris Kolp said one thing we're a little concerned about, we're at the top of the block, it's a pretty flat piece of property and property drains off a little bit towards the driveway, 2 feet down. We'll be sending the water to the sump pump that way I think, between the properties. I'd love to send it to the front, but they don't have that ditch dug deep enough.

Jack Wyban states the whole subdivision is flat. There's not much in the way of drainage. Hopefully the Village Engineers are planning to do some storm sewers. For the most part, the water is surface drainage.

Mr. Klein said I live on Worton Pk. I put in drain tile about 9 yrs ago and it's helped a lot.

DECISION

Mr. Miozzi, seconded by Mr. Klein made a motion to approve addition for Chris Kolp at 984 Woodlane Dr. as presented.

ROLL CALL

Ayes: Mr. Dinardo, Mr. Klein, Mrs. Wervey, Mr. Miozzi

Nays: None

Motion Carried.

Drawings Approved & Signed.

**David Soriano
6786 Bonnieview Rd.
NEW Single Family Home**

Chairman Dinardo said next is a new single family home at 6786 Bonnieview Rd.

Ashlie Wallenhorst with Joseph Myers Architects introduced herself. This is a traditional colonial, brick & vinyl siding with a courtyard, garage & driveway. The garage door will be side entrance.

Mrs. Wervev asked for confirmation this is the lot that just had trees cut down.

David Soriano confirmed it is.

Chairman asked David if he's seen the plans for his neighbor's new home.

David Soriano replied he has not. I've spoken with the builder. He's starting in the spring. He stated his garage door is facing the street.

Chairman commented he likes David's proposed double fireplace, one for the outside and one for the inside.

Ashlie Wallenhorst displays sample materials; brown roof shingles. The house is overall earth tones. Dark brown shutters, vintage wicker siding with antique parchment trim, white trim windows and white soffits.

Mrs. Wervev asked the total sq footage.

Ashlie Wallenhorst replied about 2800 sq ft.

Chairman asked about setback. David Soriano replied setback is about 75' from street.

Chairman asked, you're doing a copper roof over the bay window? David Soriano said I think so.

DECISION

Mr. Klein, seconded by Mrs. Wervev made a motion to approve proposed new single family home for David Soriano at 6786 Bonnieview Rd. as presented.

ROLL CALL

Ayes: Mr. Dinardo, Mr. Klein, Mrs. Wervev, Mr. Miozzi

Nays: None

Motion Carried.

Drawings Approved & Signed.

**Lucy Hu
6933 Ravine Dr.
Addition**

Chairman Dinardo asked representatives for Lucy Hu from Any Season Construction to state their name and explain proposal.

Randy Warren and James Earle introduce themselves.

Randy Warren explains project. This addition will come out from the front of the house. There was an existing 8' reverse gable. They want a foyer entryway with a 4' porch on the front. They want to open it up into the main house. We're taking out the existing door. The floor will blend in with the existing tile. It's a basic entryway. They want a window on the left side to see people pulling in. We'll match the whole house with a hip. There's a little gable on the back. The existing brick is the old yellow brick. Twenty-one inch eaves, all white trim, the roof is brand new, we'll match that.

Chairman said John Marrelli will need to see a site plan to assure the setbacks comply. The drawing you submitted has a synthetic stone. I know that's an AutoCAD hatch pattern. I'm hoping it's not going to be the stone hatch. Do you have a sample?

Randy Warren replied Lucy's husband's in Japan right now and won't be back for a couple weeks. They make the decisions together. I know they have samples.

Chairman advised we're not going to be able to get this approved tonight without seeing samples. We'll go through this and try to assist you in the things you'll need when you come back in two weeks.

Members review color photographs. This brick is from the 60's.

Mr. Miozzi asked if there was an existing porch they went on top of.

James Earle replied we re-roofed the whole roof and brought in a valley down in the front. The front posts that were existing weren't even holding the thing up. We tore it down, took the posts out, and poured the concrete. We had to get the posts out of the way. The foundation will be 3 courses of block.

Chairman said you're essentially creating a vestibule for relief before you get into the house. You'll have no issue matching the shingles. Are you replacing the fascia?

Randy Warren said no. It had a wooden plywood soffit with no ventilation. We tore that out and put a soffit all the way around it, color is white. The fascia will be the same on the addition. The 6 x 6 posts will be wrapped in stone.

ARB Minutes

Sept 13, 2012

Pg #6

Chairman asked about those posts wrapped in stone. We need to look at that proportion. What's going to happen at the top where the roof comes in? You're showing it stops, but that's not really going to happen if you're going to encase that 6 x 6 in stone.

Randy Warren said we're going to cap the tops.

Chairman asked how they're going to detail that. How are you going to handle the base and the cap, and how is it going to tie in? That's a pretty big detail.

Randy Warren said that's something I need to go over with the brick layer.

Chairman said the actual stone material to tie into this very light orange is very critical.

James Earle replied he found a nature stone that's very close in color. It's nature stone, not brick.

Chairman said you'll need to bring in a sample of that stone.

James Earle said I suggested to the homeowner I didn't think the stone on the pillars would look right. Chairman agrees.

Chairman said you have a concrete slab and stone underneath that slab. I don't know how much will be visible underneath there.

Randy Warren said none on the front porch. Right now from the house to the front of the porch it drops off 18". There wouldn't be hardly anything showing underneath the porch.

Chairman said you may not want to put stone under there. You may want to use another material or leave as concrete. I'll leave that up to you.

James Earle said John Marrelli said it has to be stone all the way down.

Chairman said he may not realize it's only going to be several inches.

James Earle said another issue I discussed with John is the measurement from the road to the actual addition. The next door neighbor is set back a little further.

Chairman said that's the site plan we discussed that you'll have to come back with showing the setback. You'll need a sketch of the road in relationship to the property line.

Mrs. Wervev advised James when the homeowner bought their house there should have been a survey sketch in their title. That'll give you an idea.

Chairman notes the side window that'll match existing, white vinyl. Are you reusing the front doors?

James Earle replied no. Those are new French doors with screen. This door will be a little smaller. They have a 6' door and proposed is 66" roughly.

Mr. Miozzi asked if they plan on moving heat in that space.

James Earle replied the homeowner said eventually they may want electric heat.

Chairman asked the Board what their feeling is about the window over the French doors. You have no semi-circle windows anywhere. I wonder if that should be more rectilinear. Board agrees.

TABLED

Applicant to return Sept 27 with the following:

1. Pictures of house details.
2. Stone material samples.
3. Revise window above doors to be more trapezoid.
4. Discuss column materials. What cap & base will be and how they'll tie into roof.
5. Discuss what will be done at base of concrete slab.
6. Submit site plan.
7. Submit electrical plan.
8. Submit energy calcs for heating.
9. Revise drawings to reflect proposed changes.

**Charter One Bank
789 SOM Ctr. Rd.
Renovation (revisions from ARB 8/9)**

Chairman Dinardo said our final item is Charter One proposal. Joe Prcela should be here shortly to explain this project along with Architect Robert Buonaspinga. Tonight will be the revisions to the ARB meeting that occurred on 8/9.

List of Revisions:

1. Philadelphia sign company will submit separately.
2. On the north elevation, remove the bollards and existing concrete foundations and existing secondary concrete walk from the existing concrete walk to the building. Add mulch or landscaping. "Not accommodated for in current budget"

Robert said we didn't realize we're adding a sidewalk to the night drop. So we'd be taking the existing sidewalk out, putting another new in for the night drop. There's a night drop that's being used that we didn't consider at the last meeting. We're leaving the window alone, taking out the vinyl siding and making an eifs material. The 4 posts are being left there to keep people from driving in. They act like bollards. If we remove them, we have to remove the foundations entirely because they stick up about 2" off the sidewalk. Mrs. Wervey said but they're not really bollards. Robert said we could

probably take them out and try to patch the sidewalk. Chairman said it'll be a lot cheaper than spending the money on the eifs. **Robert will take suggestion back to Charter One.**

3. Make cornice (coping accent) at entrance, west elevation, larger to more match the existing complex. "REVISED"
4. Add a sloped EIFS cornice, smaller than at entrance, to the rest of the elevations. "REVISED"
5. Replace existing dumpster enclosure on east side of the building or fix and paint existing enclosure. "REVISED"

Robert said we'll replace all the boards with cedar and stain them.

6. Use 2" rigid insulation under first layer of EIFS for additional shadow line. "REVISED"
7. West elevation main entrance canopy; remove one column and foundation from each side. Wrap the two remaining columns in brick, thin brick, or EIFS to look like brick to match existing complex. Until this area is fully exposed to view, I have to assume that we will need to temporarily support the canopy and replace the existing beam in order to remove one column on each side. "Not accommodated for in current budget"

Robert said the cost was \$7,000 for the entire item. A little background, we didn't make these decisions haphazardly. They put their contractor in touch with me and we talked about details. He priced out every item on the list. It went up the chain of command and came back down to this is what we can afford. Honestly, they tried to accommodate everything. They budget 'x' amount per facility per year. It doesn't mean they can't go back and try to budget something next year. Joe may be able to explain the budgeting process better.

Mrs. Wervev said this bank is not really married to the center. Chairman said Charter One Bank is putting the money up to do these improvements. They had a limited budget. We're glad as a Board they're making the efforts to enhance their building. We appreciate that. We're just working together to see what can we do to incorporate the same design features from the building behind.

Mr. Klein thinks either way, if it's painted, wrapped in aluminum or eifs, if you're not doing brick, it'll look fine. Mr. Miozzi concerned about it getting kicked and beat up. Chairman said they make a heavier impact eifs for abuse.

Joe Prcela arrives 8:35 p.m.

Chairman catches Joe up to speed. We're talking about the front entry now and what to do with the columns. The Board requested that the columns match what the center built

behind and that wasn't in the budget. We're trying to come up with a compromise. Mrs. Wervey said our concern is wrapping them in eifs for long term probably isn't the greatest solution for maintenance.

Robert said the aluminum that's there has held up relatively well. It's just old. Unless we introduce something else and carry it throughout the rest of the building, it's either going to be aluminum or eifs. What if we put a base under both columns?

Joe Prcela 904 Northboro introduced himself. This may be a good time to take a step back and see where this project came from. I've been a resident of the Village for a long time. When Musca properties underwent their redevelopment, Charter One being a free standing I don't think was really asked to do anything. I've been with Charter One for about 14 months and we had some discretionary funding for some exterior models and I thought it'd be great for being a resident of the Village and having some influence, to put some monies here. Unfortunately the budget was predetermined before we got into it. We have a pretty finite budget. We have a little bit of room to move but not a lot. That building is right in our front yard. It's there, it's visible. We thought it would be good to come here and try to put together what we thought would fit our budget and make it look more similar to the rest of the center. With that being said, after this Boards comments to our Architect a couple weeks ago, we had our GC's re-price everything and we were in a position where we need to either compromise with this governing body or we need to take it off the table and move it to another municipality. I actually went through with our Project Manager Team and looked line by line at the line items and suggested which ones we would keep and which ones we would not keep. There are two ways to do this. We can come to compromise now and try and get it done yet this year or we can send that budget over to some other project and hope something comes available next year or the year after. I'm not trying to play hard ball at all. I'd like to see it beautified. I think some of the comments this Board has made are really good. It's just a matter of which ones we can afford. With that being said, I have the authority to probably give out a little bit more than Robert does, but I'd like to get some resolution tonight if possible.

Chairman said the Board appreciates the fact that as a resident you did what you did and got them to spend money at this location.

Chairman recaps what was agreed upon with existing columns, north elevation for item #2 to help with the budget. Joe is fine with that. We want to do it right. It's a very prominent corner.

8. Replace low, square eifs areas on either side of main entry door with wood backed, aluminum panel. "REVISED"
9. Take the vertical accent strip off of the south elevation which intersects the proposed signage. "REVISED"

10. Add higher parapet walls, matching the front covered entry, on both the north elevation and south elevation to better conceal the HVAC rooftop unit. “Not accommodated for in current budget”

Chairman said I think this was more trying to shield for the traffic going north on 91.

Robert said we talked about a couple different ways we could build it to bring the cost down. Budget number came in at \$47,900. We're still looking at screening options.

Joe said we looked at plastic louvered covers. They didn't look any better than what's there. We talked about some type of wrap around the units. I'm open to suggestions. This is the big one that will make or break the budget.

Robert said we can all retire if we can figure out a way to hide HVAC.

Mr. Miozzi said we put up metal slats with reflective tape on them that changes color down Euclid. We'll re-stripe it again this year to hide all the HVAC units. They call it art.

Robert said the other concern from my perspective is the roof. It's going to need to be replaced, so maybe when Charter One budgets to replace the roof, that would be the best time to put in some kind of screen.

Chairman suggested for now, paint the green stack black. Robert can do that.

Mr. Miozzi asked if there's a sign that goes above the teller on the south elevation.

Robert replied there's a Charter One sign that goes on the west side in that long block.

Chairman talks about signage. Currently the Charter One sign is white and all the signage behind it is black and evening it turns to white. Charter One's color scheme is green, is it not? Joe confirmed scheme is green. Chairman asked the Board's feeling on this.

Robert said my understanding is they're doing green everywhere.

Mrs. Wervev prefers not to discuss signage at this point until Philadelphia submits and John is present. We did impose restrictions on the center as far as signage color to make it consistent. Chairman said keep in mind this is independent. Joe confirmed Charter One is a separate parcel.

11. Re-design the drive through overhang to be more appealing. Paint sanitary stack on the roof black. “Not accommodated for in current budget”

Robert said we talked and went back and forth about the trim. It came down to just take a look at it and see what we can do. When this was priced, the contractor put in a figure

for it. We can put trim on it. Chairman said that's all we're looking for, is a piece of trim, at the overhang area over the drive-up teller.

Chairman Dinardo thanked Robert Buonaspinga & Joe Prcela for the nice job. We thank Charter One for going through this process.

DECISION

Mr. Miozzi, seconded by Mr. Klein made a motion to approve proposed revisions for Charter One Bank renovations at 789 SOM Ctr Rd. as noted:

1. Take columns out north elevation & cut out foundation piece.
2. Combine columns and create base west elevation.
3. Add trim on bump-out over the drive-thru window.
4. Paint stack.
5. Incorporate screening when it comes time to re-roof.

ROLL CALL

Ayes: Mr. Dinardo, Mr. Klein, Mrs. Wervey, Mr. Miozzi

Nays: None

Motion Carried.

Drawings Approved & Signed As Noted.

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, Mr. Klein, seconded by Mr. Miozzi made a motion to adjourn the meeting.

ROLL CALL

Ayes: All

Nays: None

Motion Carried.

Meeting adjourned at 9:05 p.m.

Chairman

Secretary