

**ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD  
MEETING MINUTES  
Mayfield Village  
Dec 8, 2011**

The Architectural Review Board met in regular session on Thurs, Dec 8, 2011 at 7:30 p.m. at the Mayfield Village Civic Center, Main Conference Room. Chairman Dinardo presided.

**ROLL CALL**

**Present:** Mr. Ron Dinardo Chairman  
Mr. Joshua Klein Chairman Pro Tem  
Mr. Ivo Tombazzi  
Mrs. Mary Ann Wervey  
Mr. Carmen Miozzi

**Also Present:** Mr. John Marrelli Building Commissioner  
Ms. Deborah Garbo Secretary

Michael Girbino Fire Marshall  
Bill Thomas Director Parks & Recreation

**CONSIDERATION OF MEETING MINUTES: Oct 27, 2011**

Mr. Dinardo, seconded by Mr. Tombazzi made a motion to approve the meeting minutes of Oct 27, 2011.

**ROLL CALL**

Ayes: All  
Nays: None

**Motion Carried  
Minutes Approved as Written.**

**PROPOSALS**

1. **Monument Sign** Tommy V's Pastaria 6687 Wilson Mills Rd.  
Gary Ann Hair Studio 6693 Wilson Mills Rd.  
Musca Properties, LLC  
Cicogna Electric & Sign Co., Inc  
**Note:** BOA approved variance 11/15
2. **NEW Library** Cuyahoga County Public Library / Mayfield Branch  
502 SOM Ctr. Rd.  
URS Corporation  
**Note:** Follow up from ARB Mtg 10/27
3. **Wildcat Park Stadium & Athletic Area Renovations**  
Mayfield High School  
6116 Wilson Mills Rd.  
TDA Architecture

**OPEN PORTION**

**Monument Sign**

Tommy V's Pastaria - 6687 Wilson Mills Rd  
Gary Ann Hair Studio - 6693 Wilson Mills Rd.  
Musca Properties, LLC

Chairman Dinardo called the meeting to order. We have with us tonight Cicogna Electric & Sign Company to present.

**Frank Cicogna** from Cicogna Sign Co. hands out a color photo of the existing monument signs on 91 and the one on the corner of the Plaza. They were recently redone by our company to match the new sign. We took the scrolls off the 2 existing ones and matched the top pieces to match the top of the architecture of the building. The sign on 91 has brick, the corner one does not. The materials will match the brick on the whole new project.

Chairman noted they've received their Board of Zoning Appeals approvals.

Mr. Marrelli notes the Zoning Board asked for address numbers on the new sign.

**Frank Cicogna** said the proposed sign is internally lit. A provision was put in the minutes at the previous meeting to allow a third or fourth tenant to take a position on this sign. That would mean Tommy V's or Gary Ann's would have to give up a portion of theirs.

Chairman said John brought up the issue that the sign copy of both tenants does not match the copy approved on the building. You've added text:

- a) Tommy V's Pastaria has added the words 'Pizza & Catering'.
- b) Gary Ann Hair Studio has added 'Spa' to their name.

**Anthony Debenedictis**, Gary Ann's said all my paper work says Gary Ann Hair Studio & Spa. It was too much text for the building sign.

Mr. Marrelli asked Anthony if 'Spa' is part of his company name.

**Anthony Debenedictis** replied yes.

Mr. Marrelli said I'm sure 'Pizza & Catering' is not part of the Pastaria's company name. If you start getting into that, then every business is going to want to start putting on their sign what they do.

Mr. Miozzi said he noticed driving down Wilson Mills that the Dentist signage says 'Cosmetic Surgery & Implants'. The Orthodontist says 'Family & Pediatric Orthodontics'.

Mr. Marrelli said if two more users want a spot on this sign, something's got to go. I don't want hodge-podge.

ARB Mtg Minutes

Dec 8, 2011

Pg #3

Chairman said the corner sign says 'Tommy V's Pastaria' only. Can you add Pizza & Catering to the existing sign? I think it needs to be consistent.

Frank Cicogna said he can change the panels to match the corner. I represent the retailer. You represent the Village. When you read the sign Tommy V's Pastaria, you have no idea that they have a large catering business there. It helps sales, which helps them with longevity in the community and helps them to be more profitable. The 'Spa' in Gary Ann's says he does facials & nails also without saying 'facial & nails'. I don't want to cause a traffic problem. I've been doing this for 35 years. I try to keep the main name bold and when they want to find out what they do, they can look close enough and see it.

Mrs. Wervev asked what our code says.

Mr. Marrelli said there're two different kind of signs; identification sign & advertising sign. The copy he's putting on is more advertising than identification.

Frank Cicogna said there're two different kinds of signs in our world; off-premise advertising and on-premise identification. A billboard is an advertising sign.

Mr. Klein said to be honest with you, I'm in Tommy V's often and I didn't know they do catering.

Chairman Dinardo said all we ask is the signs be consistent.

Frank Cicogna said I'll change the faces on the existing signs to add 'Pizza & Catering' and 'Spa'.

Chairman said another issue of concern is the position of the sign. Do we have a survey of the property and setback?

Mr. Marrelli asked, do you know if you're on or off the property?

Frank Cicogna said we know we're exactly positioned the same way relative to the road as we are on 91. I think both signs are in the right-of-way.

Mrs. Wervev said they shouldn't be. You need to be on your own property.

Mr. Marrelli asked, how do I issue you a permit for a sign on State property? You're going to have to figure out where that property line is.

Frank Cicogna said without a survey, we don't know specifically. If the property line is the back side of the sidewalk, we are one foot off it like we are on the other one. I've done a lot of signs and a lot of them are in right-of-ways and nobody says a word. I've never in 35 years done a survey for placement.

Chairman said if the BZA granted that variance, so be it. It has to be one foot behind the property line. The question is; where is the property line? We request you submit a survey from Musca Properties to the Building Commissioner.

Chairman Dinardo said the other item is landscaping around the base of the sign. I know we want to keep it low. There is none currently. It would be sod.

**DECISION**

Mrs. Wervey, seconded by Mr. Klein made a motion to approve the proposed monument sign for Musca Properties, LLC as noted:

1. **Submit survey to Building Commissioner.**
2. **Add copy at intersection sign to say ‘Pizza & Catering’ for Tommy V’s Pastaria and ‘Spa’ for Gary Ann Hair Studio.**
3. **Brick material to match existing center.**
4. **Sign on Wilson Mills to match sign on SOM Center.**

**ROLL CALL**

Ayes: Mr. Dinardo, Mr. Klein, Mr. Tombazzi, Mrs. Wervey, Mr. Miozzi

Nays: None

**Motion Carried.**

**Drawings Approved & Signed As Noted.**

Frank Cicogna thanked the Board Members. We’re close to having all the tenants signs approved and in production.

\*\*\*\*\*

NEW Library  
Cuyahoga County Public Library / Mayfield Branch  
502 SOM Ctr. Rd.  
URS Corporation

Chairman Dinardo said our next item is the new library. URS Corporation’s here to present.

**Christopher Diehl**, **URS** said it’s good to see everyone. I have Tina Belz with me tonight. Last meeting we went through the whole building. I don’t think we need to go through the whole show again. The things we talked a lot about were the column size, the canopy, the entry. We spent a lot of time on the dimension and geometry of the shingle. I’m going to revisit with the power point just those few images where we left it and then to the new imagery that illustrates where we have it.

**Recap last meeting**. The columns at the front entry as you remember were 3” columns that had 3 parts to it. This was a dimensional hardy plank shingle that was residential in scale. We spent a lot of time talking whether that was too small or not.

To remind everyone, it was all about the thin columns holding up a thin canopy, it was about the roof canopy both, low canopy 12' height which is consistent throughout and then the high canopy which is a height of 22' to the parapet of the top of that piece.

You can see the scale of the shingle in this view and then stone. I brought samples of the stone. We have a Charles Luck exterior sandstone, a veneer, and then the hardy plank elsewhere. The canopy is a wood plank ceiling underneath that extends to the inside.

**New Material.** First example. If you remember, we saw the house on the west bank of the flats. Also, the Providence Art Association Museum, looking at a larger module. That module is 20" high by 40" wide, 4 units cut out of each sheet (about 44" wide). We also looked at a smaller module. If we could get 4 pieces out of a 4 x 8 piece of hardy plank, this takes the module to 5 so we have no waste.

We have details of those two; a larger module on both of those principal elevations as a painted shingle and then the smaller module. When you look in detail at the larger module 20" x 44" exposed lap siding, it would essentially be detailed as a rain screen, and then the tighter module coming along.

**Columns.** The next elevations, we have two options for the columns. Before we had 3" columns as a triangle. Remember how passionate I was about how thin that column and canopy was? Our Structural Engineer was with the passion, but in order to make that work, it trended toward a bigger single column because it became too complex to make 3 columns work with all the structural bridging. This shows a 6" pipe on top of an 8" foundation piece. That foundation piece is important because it matches the height of the stone sill. We have that one and then an 8" pipe. So the 6" column & the 8" column are both considerably larger than what we showed before.

**Hardy Plank.** Mr. Marrelli asked about the seams on the hardy plank. Christopher said all edges have a line to them. There's a reveal depending on how the sun hits it (showing example of the left bank building west side of the flats). It's a larger 20 x 44 module.

Chairman asked what module is being proposed for the library.

Christopher replied he's looking for the Board's opinion. The small shingle doesn't quite work as well. The bigger module is 5 pieces per sheet keeping the same 4' width and we'd overlap it. That would be certified by hardy plank with a warrantee. It'd be factory finished, they'd do the cut and touch up the edges to make sure they're sealed.

Chairman is intrigued by the angle cut. It's how you stagger the shingle. It's a neat approach. This proposal is a lot better than your first go around with the smaller shingle.

Board concurs and prefers the bigger shingle.

Mrs. Wervev asked about the color.

Christopher said it's all about budget. Right now we have stone and we're looking at two different kinds of glass. The color of glass and our store front will determine what the rest of the color palate will be. We'll submit the color palate as a packet for review later.

**Columns.** Christopher states this is twice the diameter we looked at last time. Structurally the 6" pipe is all we need. Right now the material at the base is just concrete to keep as simple as possible because it's going to get kicked and salt.

Chairman asked about dye color for the concrete. Christopher said the question about dye is if the salt will leach the color out of the concrete. Christopher will submit sample of colored concrete.

Chairman asked, if we go with an 8" column, can we have it  $\frac{3}{4}$ " inch wider at the base? You need something. You can't go from steel to concrete with no transition.

Christopher explained the concrete has to be 8" based on the space between outside facing concrete and the rebar. Steel pipe doesn't come in true 8" dimension. We spent some time talking to our Electrical Engineers about this today. It's how to make the base purposeful for where the column goes.

**Ceiling.** We detailed the ceiling so all of it weeps. We're not trying to seal it, insulate around the building portion where it's exposed, or make it water tight. We want it to breathe.

Chairman asked about the bees? You're going to have an issue with insects. Christopher said they'll have a black bug screen on top of it.

Christopher said we've chosen a Garapa Wood for under the ceiling canopy that doesn't need finished. It can take the weather, the humidity. On the inside we're looking at a bamboo veneer. Our intent is to carry the wood through the inside as much as we can.

**Columns.** Chairman said we really haven't resolved whether we want the 6" or 8". We know we'll have a colored concrete base.

Mrs. Wervey still doesn't like the look of the columns. Better, but not great.

Mr. Klein asked if the columns can be done in a timber.

Christopher said in the beginning we looked at having all the columns be wood supporting the structure up above. It wasn't cost effective. We looked at another Machado & Silvetti Library in Austin Massachusetts that has a wood ceiling that inspired this wood outdoor ceiling with wood columns. The windows are wood and the columns are wood. It's showing quite a bit of wear and that bldg is only 12-15 yrs old.

Mr. Miozzi asked what kind of plate's on top of the column. You can use a 6" and have a stainless steel tube made. I don't know your color plan for painting the column.

Christopher said that's all based on our color palate. Right now we're looking at a deep warm gray, a medium/deep taupe for the outside frame. The inside has to be brighter for LEED. It can't be a dark frame as you look outside because of the contrast. It's budget. We have to make sure we can afford the cap and that'll help trigger the color.

Chairman Dinardo said let me try and help Mary Ann with the trouble she's having with this. Chris, I think we had the discussion about the perception of the surrounding communities accepting our Western Reserve Architecture. This is Modern Architecture here. I think you have to use a slim column for this design. If this were in Chicago or New York, there'd be no discussion. But we're in Mayfield Village and we need to be aware of how residents in the surrounding communities will look at this.

Christopher said I did a lot of photography up and down SOM Ctr. It's not monolithic. The Middle School sets the tenor, then Village Hall, Musca Plaza, the New Police Station and then Progressive that goes way beyond. Remember the whole notion of a Nature Center. Tina will vouch I have fought tooth and nail for that stone. Mary Ann said we love the stone. Christopher continued, the Zako house has a lot of stone, the Nature Center at the North Chagrin Metro Pk. The materiality of it and the wood ceiling are huge, fighting tooth and nail for both the wood and stone every day. A lot of money goes into making that possible. At the end of the day architecturally a lot of the rest of the detailing has to make it very simple and let that material read strongly & well. What I've found practicing for a long enough time, the more stylistic and more aggressive the form gets, the leaner the material palate gets to pull that off. It's balance. Here, it's very material rich, but the form itself is meant to be very simple, minimal in a way but let the richness of the material make a statement. And we're not done fighting that battle yet until the bids come in. The climate out there is volatile.

Mrs. Wervey asked, why do you think you need that feature at all?

Christopher replied it goes back to trees, the notion of this building being under a canopy of trees and the fact where the woodland wetland is in the corner of this site and the North Chagrin Metro Pk and the notion of Aristotle reading his book under a tree. Think about very light trunks. From a geometry standpoint, this is meant to be the low sampling, low canopy, smaller trunks. This is the high canopy 18" or 24" diameter columns that hold up the high canopy. It's all about the light coming into the library from that.

Mrs. Wervey asked, can't you just delete that whole structure?

Christopher said no. That overhang is huge. That sets up everything. When you see this from the outside and see that wood coming out to receive you with a hole in it and tree in the middle, it's the moment where the building surrounds the trees rather than the trees surrounding the building. You need the columns there so that canopy feels light.

Chairman said that tall tree in the middle is the whole design.

**Concrete Base.** Chairman inquires if we need a pattern for the stained color concrete.

Christopher replied it would be better if he could get the color to match the stone.

Chairman said we're looking at staining this concrete base to the post, have you looked at stained concrete for the wall? Christopher will look into it.

Mr. Klein comments it has to be done right. They did the stained concrete at the new plaza in Strongsville and it's flaking. Not sure why it failed, maybe because the work was done in winter.

**Tree** (center of canopy). Chairman asked about the height.

Christopher said we're still looking at one or multiple trees. Our Landscape Architect is advocating for 2-3 Colander Maples. We're looking at a cluster.

Mrs. Wervev likes Birch.

## SUMMARY

Next meeting bring color selection of:

- Wood
- Stone
- Glass
- Window Frame
- Hardy Plank
- Tree Selection

Chairman Dinardo asked timeline on going out to BID.

Christopher said mid Feb. The program has changed for the monument sign now that it's LED.

Chairman asked Christopher what he's going to do for a coping at the top of the two-story structure with the hardy plank.

Christopher said metal or FRP to match. That's TBD. I'd like the color to be dark.

## **DECISION**

**Board gives URS Team direction to proceed. Return Jan 2012 for final approval.**

\*\*\*\*\*

**Wildcat Park**  
Mayfield High School - 6116 Wilson Mills Rd.  
TDA Architecture

Chairman Dinardo introduced TDA Architecture to present the project. Before you start, I'd

like to run a video titled 'Mayfield Wildcat Park 3-D Animation'. It's on the Mayfield City Schools website. Video begins.

**Jeff Henderson, TDA Architecture** following video states that's the Master Plan & big dream. Wildcat is their own fundraising thing. The School is separate from that in a sense. The School's doing parts of it. It comes down to budget.

In terms of the scope of stuff that's happening and to be consistent with what's said in the video:

1. Turf field is being replaced.
2. Track being replaced. Strip the surface off the current track and resurface.
3. Parking Lot NOT part of this phase.
4. Visitor Stands NOT part of this phase.
5. Replacing Home Stands. Will seat 2500. Five hundred seats/chairs in the middle will be leased out as a fundraiser. Will be ADA accessible.
6. New Press Box.
7. New Softball Field. We'll add drainage to solve drainage problems.
8. New Fencing, Back Stops & Dug Outs.
9. Two (2) Soccer Practice Fields.

Mr. Marrelli said the Visitor Stands stay the way they are. Addressing Fire Marshall Girbino, don't we have issues with those Visitor bleachers?

Fire Marshall Girbino said the current Home Stands are in better shape than the Visitor Stands.

Jeff said it would be another \$250,000 to put in Visitor Stands. Short term, money will be put in for repairs. Replacement's in the Master Plan.

Mr. Marrelli states you're discounting the safety factor because of cost. You're replacing lights for hundreds of thousands of dollars but patching up bleachers that are possibly unsafe.

Jeff said that's in the judgment of the District.

**Concession Stand.** Jeff said the existing concession stand will remain. It won't continue to be used as a concession stand. It's where all the main power/distribution comes out of. They'll turn this into a small training room, i.e. for taping ankles & equipment storage.

Disc & Shot will be brought into the area between the fields.

**Main Gate Area.** They're only going to build ½ of this, one side (north side) at the moment. New bathrooms Men's/Women's in the front here, two ticket booths and concession stands on the outside. All the fencing will be replaced. The track will have a 4' fence around it, and an 8' fence that runs around the perimeter.

**Emergency Vehicle Access.** Mr. Marrelli asked how the Fire Dept will get an emergency vehicle through.

Jeff replied there'll be a double gate with vehicle access that'll be maintained and a turn style like they have now. The ambulance will have access through a gate.

Fire Marshall Girbino asked the width of the gate.

Jeff said whatever you need.

Discussion ensued.

Following the meeting Lt. Girbino had the opportunity to speak personally with the Jeff regarding hydrant & emergency vehicle access in greater detail. Jeff explained the gate was to provide access from the drive near the stands to the track and that there is no gate at the entrance to the access drive itself. Therefore, since Lt. Girbino sees no need to drive the fire apparatus onto the track, he feels there is no need for a gate wider than 12'. A 12' gate should be sufficient to allow access for an ambulance.

**Fire Hydrant.** Lt. Girbino said we need water supply back there. The closest hydrant exceeds 400'. Generally 400' is your minimum access from hydrant to structure.

Jeff noted that all this is non-combustible construction.

**Plaza Area.** These are potential areas for landscaping, possibly a memorial garden. We're not designing them. They have groups doing that.

**Parking Lot.** At the moment this is NOT part of the First Phase. We're going to run the loop road in, but not the parking itself. Parking lot still needs to be designed.

**Storm Water / Drainage.** Chairman asked why a big green area remains.

Jeff replied because of storm water. This is taken into account when that parking lot gets designed. Underneath the existing field is drainage now and goes this way into the creek. I know there's ongoing conversation with the Village re drainage, but not sure where that is.

**Outdoor Seating.** Chairman asked if outdoor seating is available. Jeff demonstrates an asphalt paved area, a zone that could be outdoor seating.

Mr. Marrelli asked if there's not an event, can you get through the main gate to the plaza?

Jeff replied the public always has access to the track. They wouldn't come through the gate, they'd come through the turn style. The turn style keeps out bicycles.

Chairman asked about bike racks. Jeff said bike racks are something for consideration.

**Photometrics.** Jeff has them for the field and has requested it for entire site. Chairman emphasizes concern with lighting and the residents along Lander. Jeff's guess is there'll be less light going off site than is now.

Jeff Henderson said that completes the scope of the project, the overview.

- **Materials**

Jeff said from a material standpoint, we played off of the pool field house façade, matching split face to that and utilizing a smooth CMU as an accent that plays off that. Intent is to match materials on back of High School. Split face won't be painted. The gray & white accent is a very simple palate. We have an accent Mayfield green. There's a metal coping on top of that wall that brings that through.

- **Main Gate & Three Building View**

Jeff points out main gate, ticket booth, two windows with covers. Toilet room facility (no windows) and the concession stand that opens up on both sides that can be utilized when there's no event. They can open up the side towards the parking lot and utilize that for baseball games. We have access to both sides of the restrooms from the ends. There're ornamental metal gates that occur at those spaces in between the buildings. From the end of those concession stands back, it goes back to a black vinyl chain link fence.

We have a canopy, not a hugely functional canopy in terms of protection from rain, just a stadium entry signal thing.

Mr. Marrelli asked about roof top units on the buildings.

Jeff replied none. They're not heated. They'll be winterized. We have electric ceiling heaters. End of season, they'll pull out the pipes, shut down & drain. It's just providing some level of comfort on the cold football evenings.

Mr. Marrelli asked Jeff if he has to meet the energy code for that.

Jeff replied no.

- **Colors**

Chairman Dinardo said I understand your attempt to match the colors with what's on the rear of the existing building. With all due respect to the previous Board, I'm not a fan of that color. The reason we approved that color was we had no choice. You were adding on to an existing building with that color. I think here, the gray choice looks like a prison. I think your video shows better use of colors. Jeff notes those video colors are the Wildcat Group's choice.

Chairman thinks it needs softer earth tone colors vs gray.

ARB Mtg Minutes

Dec 8, 2011

Pg #12

Jeff said it's a fairly warm gray, not a cool gray.

Chairman said you have this nice entry, the design elements and massing are good, we just need a better color selection. To this Board, do you feel this can be independent? Can this stadium stand alone, be its own and separate from the School?

Chairman replays Wildcat Park 3-D Video.

Discussion followed on color options.

Chairman recommends applicant come back with a new color scheme.

Board agrees gates & fencing should all be black. The split face block needs different color.

Chairman said the canopies are sloped back to the building. How are you holding them up structurally, let alone having water come back into the building. Maybe they should be wider for cover. Mr. Marrelli said throwing it out another foot may be a snow load issue.

Jeff said the door colors will match the block to make them disappear.

Chairman said the canopy you see at the entry where it says Wildcat Stadium looks like a BP canopy. Do we want to see some architectural detail here?

Jeff said that material is a metal Alucobond. This piece wants to be as thin as possible. It's just a signal for a gate, an entry.

Chairman said maybe it needs lights.

Jeff replied there're lights on the buildings but no lights in the canopies.

Mrs. Wervev asked, is this Wildcat Park Group a real thing?

Jeff said their plan is maybe more community oriented, more park like, walking trails. Their vision goes way beyond. The District is treating this as their Athletic Facility and they're making the improvements to those parts of it.

Mr. Miozzi asked about the money people are donating. They'll expect to see what's shown in the video and all they see are improvements. Your plan is to do the 3 buildings, and whose going to finish it and when? There's a grand plan, but two sides to it. Half is being built now, if it doesn't get finished, you have ½ a place.

Chairman asked Jeff if he's working with Jim Wallis from the Wildcat Group.

Jeff said we met with him and showed him the plan, but they're their own entity and separate from the District.

ARB Mtg Minutes

Dec 8, 2011

Pg #13

Chairman asked, does this mean we look at this design as stand alone? We may not see the other half.

Mr. Klein added, there's no commitment for the other half.

Chairman Dinardo said I may have to request that small building/ticket booth be built as per drawing. Then at least you'll have an entry. I think you need to talk it over with the School Board. Maybe it's just the shell. We can't count on the rest of this ever happening, it could be years from now.

Jeff Henderson said most of the cost is the shell. These buildings are nothing but shells. Think about a year from now when you have a brand new turf field, brand new track, brand new bleachers, no one is going to pay attention to what happens in that front.

Discussion ensued with issue of chain link fence dying into post and various options for building placement.

### **SUMMARY**

Block colors

Canopies over windows – wider & deeper

Light post poles

Scoreboard – relocating existing to south end

Fencing - baked on enamel

Split Face a true color

Doors – same as bldg color so as to disappear

New steel framed Bleachers – need elevation dwg & color

Press Box – bring color

Gate – Lt. Girbino will review for emergency vehicle access

**Next Meeting for follow-up:** Thurs Dec 22<sup>nd</sup> @ 7:30 p.m.

### **ADJOURNMENT**

There being no further business, Mr. Klein, seconded by Mr. Miozzi made a motion to adjourn the meeting.

### **ROLL CALL**

Ayes: All

Nays: None

**Motion Carried.**

**Meeting adjourned at 10:00 p.m.**

---

Chairman

---

Secretary